**PH145: PLATO AND DESCARTES**

**Reading List**

**Module Tutors: Dr. David Woods (Plato) and Prof. Stephen Butterfill (Descartes)**

**Emails:** [**D.Woods@warwick.ac.uk**](mailto:D.Woods@warwick.ac.uk) **/** [**S.Butterfill@warwick.ac.uk**](mailto:S.Butterfill@warwick.ac.uk)

**How to do well in this module:** There is a direct correlation between the marks students tend to get for modules like this one and the amount of reading they do independently outside the classroom in preparation for lectures and seminars. The first thing you should do in preparation for each seminar is to read the indicated sections from Plato’s *Republic* or Descartes' *Meditations*. But it is recommended to read at least one or two of the items from the list of secondary readings indicated for each week (items marked ‘\*\*’ are essential; items marked ‘\*’ are strongly recommended). The recommended readings will help you to test and develop your own understanding of the main text.

**Plato**

**Main text:**

\*\*Grube, G. M. A. and Reeve, C. D. C. 1992. *Plato: Republic*. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, Inc. *(Or other translations from good publishers*.*)*

**Useful introductory texts:**

\*\*Annas, Julia. 1981. *An Introduction to Plato’s Republic*. Oxford: OUP.

\*Brown, Eric, "Plato's Ethics and Politics in The Republic", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Winter 2011 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL =<https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2011/entries/plato-ethics-politics/>.

\*Irwin, Terence. 1995. *Plato’s Ethics*. Oxford: OUP.

\*Reeve, C. D. C. 1988. *Philosopher-Kings: The Argument of Plato’s Republic*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

\*\*Pappas, N. 2013. *Routledge Philosophical Guidebook to Plato’s Republic*. London, Routledge.

\*\*Santas, Gerasimos. 2010. *Understanding Plato’s Republic*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell. White, Nicholas. P. 1979. *A Companion to Plato’s Republic*. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, Inc.

**Useful edited collections:**

Fine, Gail. 1999. *Plato 1: Metaphysics and Epistemology*. Oxford: OUP.

\*Fine, Gail. 1999. *Plato 2: Ethics, Politics, Religion, and the Soul*. Oxford: OUP.

Ferrari, G. R. F. 2007. *The Cambridge Companion to Plato’s Republic*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

\*Kraut, Richard. 1997. *Plato’s Republic: Critical Essays*. Oxford: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc.

McPherran, Mark L. 2010. *Plato’s Republic: A Critical Guide*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

\*\*Santas, Gerasimos. 2006. *The Blackwell Guide to Plato’s Republic*. Oxford: Blackwell.

**Week 1: *Republic* Book I**

\*\**Republic* Book I.

\*Annas, Julia. 1981. *An Introduction to Plato’s Republic*. Oxford: OUP. Chapter 2.

\*\*Barney, Rachel. 2006. “Socrates’ Refutation of Thrasymachus.” In G. Santas ed. *Blackwell Guide to Plato’s Republic*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Barney, Rachel, "Callicles and Thrasymachus", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Winter 2011 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL =<https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2011/entries/callicles-thrasymachus/>.

Chappell, Sophie-Grace 1993. “The Virtues of Thrasymachus.” *Phronesis* 38: 1–17.

Kahn, Charles. 1993. “Proleptic Composition in the Republic, or Why Book 1 Was Never a Separate Dialogue.” *The Classical Quarterly* 43, 1: 131–142.

\*Pappas, N. 2013. *Routledge Philosophical Guidebook to Plato’s Republic*. London, Routledge. Chs. 1–3.

\*Santas, Gerasimos. 2010. *Understanding Plato’s Republic*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell. Chs.1–2.

White, Nicholas. P. 1979. *A Companion to Plato’s Republic*. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, Inc. Summary Book I.

**Week 2: *Republic* Books II–IV**

\*\**Republic* Book II.

\*Annas, Julia. 1981. *An Introduction to Plato’s Republic*. Oxford: OUP. Chs.3–6.

Cooper, John M. 1984. “Plato’s Theory of Motivation.” History of Philosophy Quarterly 1, 1: 3–21.

\*Irwin, Terence. “Republic 2: Questions about Justice.” in G. Fine ed. Plato 2. Oxford: OUP.

Lorenz, Hendrik 2006. “The Analysis of the Soul in Plato’s Republic.” In G. Santas ed. *Blackwell Guide to Plato’s Republic*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Moss, Jessica. 2008. “Appearances and Calculations: Plato’s Division of the Soul.” *Oxford Studies in Ancient Philosophy* 34.

\*Pappas, N. 2013. *Routledge Philosophical Guidebook to Plato’s Republic*. London, Routledge. Ch. 3–5.

\*\*Sachs, David. 1963. “A Fallacy in Plato's Republic.” *The Philosophical Review* 72, 2: 141– 158. Reprinted in R. Kraut ed. *Plato’s Republic: Critical Essays*.

Santas, Gerasimos. 2006. “Methods of Reasoning about Justice in Plato’s Republic.” In G. Santas ed. *Blackwell Guide to Plato’s Republic*. Oxford: Blackwell.

\*Santas, Gerasimos. 2010. *Understanding Plato’s Republic*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell. Ch.3–5.

\*\*Shields, Christopher. 2006. “Plato’s Challenge: the Case against Justice in Republic II.” In G. Santas ed. *Blackwell Guide to Plato’s Republic*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Smith, Nicholas D. 1999. “Plato's Analogy of Soul and State.” *The Journal of Ethics* 3, 1: 31–49.

\*White, Nicholas. P. 1979. *A Companion to Plato’s Republic*. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, Inc. Summary Book II–IV.

\*Williams, Bernard. “The Analogy of City and Soul in Plato's Republic.” in *Exegesis and Argument: Studies in Greek Philosophy Presented to Gregory Vlastos*, ed., E.N. Lee et al. (Phronesis s.v. 1). Reprinted in G. Fine ed. *Plato 2*. Oxford: OUP and R. Kraut ed. Plato’s *Republic: Critical Essays*.

**Week 3: *Republic* Books V-VII.**

\*\**Republic* Book V.

*Book V*

\*\*Annas, Julia. 1976. “Plato’s “Republic” and Feminism.” *Philosophy* 51, 197: 307–321.

\*Annas, Julia. 1981. *An Introduction to Plato’s Republic*. Oxford: OUP. Ch.7–9.

Brown, Eric, "Plato's Ethics and Politics in The Republic", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Winter 2011 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL = <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2011/entries/plato-ethics-politics/>. Section 4.3.

Lee, David C. 2010. “Interpreting Plato’s Republic: Knowledge and Belief.” *Philosophy Compass* 5, 10: 854–864.

\*\*Lesser, Harry. 1979. “Plato’s Feminism.” *Philosophy* 54, 207: 113–117.

Nussbaum, Martha Craven. 1980. “Shame, Separateness, and Political Unity: Aristotle’s Criticism of Plato.” In Amélie O. Rorty ed. *Essays on Aristotle’s Ethics*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Okin, Susan Moller 1977. “Philosopher Queens and Private Wives: Plato on Women and the Family.” *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 6, 4: 345–369.

\*Pappas, N. 2013. *Routledge Philosophical Guidebook to Plato’s Republic.* London, Routledge. Ch.6, 7, 10, 11.

\*Penner, Terry. 2006. “The Forms in the Republic.” In G. Santas ed. *Blackwell Guide to Plato’s Republic*. Oxford: Blackwell.

\*Reeve, C. D. C. 1992. “The Naked Old Women in the Palaestra”, reprinted in R. Kraut ed. *Plato’s Republic: Critical Essays*. Rowman & Littlefield.

\*Santas, Gerasimos. 2010. *Understanding Plato’s Republic*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell. Ch.6.

\*Singpurwalla, Rachel. 2010. “The Tripartite Theory of Motivation in Plato’s Republic.” *Philosophy Compass* 5, 11: 880–892.

Taylor, C. C. W. 1986. “Plato's Totalitarianism.” Polis, 5: 4–29. Reprinted in G. Fine ed. *Plato 2*. Oxford: OUP.

Taylor, C. C. W. 2012. “The Role of Women in Plato’s Republic.” Rachana Kamtekar ed. *Oxford Studies in Ancient Philosophy Supplementary Volume*.

\*Vlastos, Gregory. 1989. “Was Plato a Feminist?” *Times Literary Supplement*, 4,495: 276, 288–289. Reprinted in R. Kraut ed. *Plato's Republic: Critical Essays*. Rowman & Littlefield.

White, Nicholas. P. 1979. *A Companion to Plato’s Republic*. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, Inc. Summary Book V.

*Books V-VII*

\*Annas, Julia. 1981. *An Introduction to Plato’s Republic*. Oxford: OUP. Ch.10, 12.

\*Kraut, Richard 1992. “The Defense of Justice in Plato's Republic.” in *The Cambridge Companion to Plato*, ed. Richard Kraut. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Reprinted in R. Kraut ed. *Plato's Republic: Critical Essays*. Rowman & Littlefield.

Mahoney, Timothy A. “Do Plato's Philosopher-Rulers Sacrifice Self-Interest to Justice?” *Phronesis* 37, 3: 265–282.

\*Pappas, N. 2013. *Routledge Philosophical Guidebook to Plato’s Republic*. London, Routledge. Ch.8.

\*Santas, Gerasimos. 2010. *Understanding Plato’s Republic*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell. Ch.8.

White, Nicholas. P. 1979. *A Companion to Plato’s Republic*. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, Inc. Summary Book V.

**Week 4: *Republic* Books VIII–X.**

\*\**Republic* Books III and X.

Burnyeat, M. F. 1997. “Culture and Society in Plato’s Republic.” *Tanner Lectures on Human Values*. https://tavaana.org/sites/default/files/Burnyeat99.pdf

Ferrari, G. R. F. 1989. “Plato on Poetry.” In G. A. Kennedy ed. *The Cambridge History of Literary Criticism, vol. I: Classical Criticism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

\*Kraut, Richard 1992. “The Defense of Justice in Plato's Republic.” in *The Cambridge Companion to Plato*, ed. Richard Kraut. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Reprinted in R. Kraut ed. Plato's *Republic: Critical Essays*. Rowman & Littlefield.

Lear, Jonathan. “Inside and Outside the Republic,” Phronesis, 37 (1992): 184–215.

Lear, Jonathan. “Allegory and Myth in Plato’s Republic.” In G. Santas ed. *Blackwell Guide to Plato’s Republic*. Oxford: Blackwell.

\*\*Nehamas, Alexander 1988. “Plato and the Mass Media.” *The Monist* 71, 2: 214–234. Reprinted in Nehamas 1999. *Virtues of Authenticity: Plato and Socrates*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

\*Pappas, N. 2013. *Routledge Philosophical Guidebook to Plato’s Republic*. London, Routledge. Ch.9, 12.

**Descartes**

**Main Text:**

\*\*Descartes’ *Meditations on First Philosophy* (J. Cottingham ed. for Cambridge University

Press is recommended).

**Useful introductory texts:**

\*\*Hatfield, G. 2003. *Descartes and the Meditations*. London: Routledge. (A good historically sensitive introduction to the Meditations)

\*\*Williams, B. 1978. *Descartes: The Project of Pure Inquiry*. Hassocks: Harvester Press. (Difficult, but rewarding. A very rich piece of philosophy in its own right.)

**Week ?: Intellectual Background and the Method of Doubt**

\*\**First Meditation*

\*\**Objections and Replies on Meditation One* [pp. 63-67 in Cottingham]

\*\**Preface and Synopsis* (the latter, in particular, is extremely helpful)

\*\*G. Hatfield, Gary 2003. *Descartes and the Meditations*, chs. 1 & 3

\*Williams, Bernard 1978. *Descartes: The Project of Pure Inquiry*, ch. 2 (and Appendix 3)

Broughton, Janet 2002. *Descartes' Method of Doubt*, Introduction and Part 1

Wilson, Margaret. 1978. *Descartes*, ch. 1

Newman, Lex "Descartes' Epistemology", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Winter 2016 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL = <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2016/entries/descartes-epistemology/>.

Burnyeat, M. F. 1982. “Idealism and Greek Philosophy: What Descartes Saw and Berkeley Missed.” *Philosophical Review* 91, 1982.

Cottingham, John. 2000. *Descartes*, ch. 2.

Curley, E. M. 1978. *Descartes against the Skeptics*, chs. 1-3

For more on scepticism in general, see

Dancy, Jonathan. 1985. *Introduction to Contemporary Epistemology*, ch. 1

Stroud, Barry. 1984. *The Significance of Philosophical Scepticism*, ch.1

**Week ?: The Cogito**

\*\**Second Meditation*

\*\**Objections and Replies on Meditation Two* [pp. 68-77]

\*\*Hatfield, Gary. 2003. *Descartes and the Meditations*, ch. 4

\*Williams, Bernard. 1978. *Descartes: The Project of Pure Inquiry*, ch. 3

Broughton, Janet. 2002. *Descartes' Method of Doubt*, chs. 6 & 7

Wilson, Margaret. 1978. *Descartes*, ch. 2

Markie, P. 1992. “The Cogito and Its Importance,” in Cottingham (ed.) *Cambridge Companion to Descartes* and Cottingham (ed.) *Descartes* (Oxford Readings).

J. Hintikka 1962. “The Cogito: Inference or Performance?” *The Philosophical Review* 71.

J. Carriero 1986. “The Second Meditation and the Essence of the Mind”, in A. Rorty (ed.): *Essays on Descartes' Meditations*.

**Week ?: The Existence and Role of God**

\*\**Third, Fourth and Fifth Meditation*

(See also *Objections and Replies on Meditation Three, Four and Five)*

\*\*Hatfield, Gary. 2003 *Descartes and the Meditations*, chs. 5-8

Broughton, Janet 2002. *Descartes' Method of Doubt*, chs. 8 & 9

Williams, Bernard. 1978. *Descartes: The Project of Pure Inquiry*, chs. 5-8

Wilson, Marget. *Descartes*, chs. 3 & 5

\*\*van Cleve, James. “Foundationalism, Epistemic Principles, and the Cartesian Circle” *Philosophical* Review 88, 1979; also in Cottingham (ed.) Descartes (Oxford Readings).

A. J. Kenny 1970. ‘The Cartesian Circle and Eternal Truths’, *Journal of Philosophy*.

L. Loeb, ‘The Cartesian Circle’, in Cottingham ed., *The Cambridge Companion to Descartes*.

**Week ?: Mind and Matter**

\*\**Second and Sixth Meditation*

(See also *Objections and Replies on Meditation Two, Five and Six*)

\*\*Hatfield, Gary. 2002. *Descartes and the Meditations*, chs. 8 & 9

\*Williams, Bernard. 1978. *Descartes: The Project of Pure Enquiry*, chs. 4 & 10

\*\*Wilson, Margaret. 1978. *Descartes*, chs. 2 and 6

Wilson, Margaret. 1978. ‘Cartesian Dualism’, in Hooker (ed.) *Descartes: Critical and Interpretative Essays.*

Cottingham, John. 2000. *Descartes*, ch.6

For a famous critique of dualism, see also:

Ryle, Gilbert. 1949. *The Concept of Mind*, ch. 1: “Descartes' Myth”.